Summary of review: Context Acquisition and Provisioning: Dynamic Content Negotiation in Web Environments

Recommendation: accept if improved

The topic is good and certainly influential if the ideas can make it into commodity environments.

However, there are a few issues with the format of the contribution and with some details. Remember that in order to make a good chapter for a book, the nature of the contribution should be such that the achievements in this area (state-of-the art) should be presented at large (comprehensively) as to give unfamiliar readers a good understanding. This aspect is at least equally important to the details of your research. This will probably lead to the biggest effort of your improvements. The details of the individual tests are less important than the overall outcome and the advancement of the state of the art, and should ideally be referred to in citations.

Content-wise, I miss a statement about the integration with existing proxies such as Privoxy which already runs in many commodity environments and hence would not require special installation. Is it better to have chained individual proxies or would it rather make sense to integrate all the functionality into one? The QoS measurement, for example, could probably be taken from an external component already. All of this leaves a lot of speculation and should be presented more clearly since many people in distributed systems are familiar with proxy concepts and will miss the integration aspect.

Using Google to demonstrate your measurement should be accompanied with a word of warning that especially in this case often redirections are transparently performed which might skew the results. For example, it is not possible to access google.cn from certain user agents. Why are J2SE applets specific to the operating system? The reader has «Java runs everywhere» in mind and will be confused.

Why do PC browsers not provide any context information? They already do through user-agent and maybe JavaScript. The intention was probably to say that they don't provide anything beyond this. In general it would be good to have an introductory image showing the participants or stakeholders in settings similar to yours - such as user, user's device, proxy, server and so on. Finally, there are some typos, e.g. «easies» instead of «eases».